

ENGAGING REFUGEES AND ASYLUM SEEKERS

**PROJECT REVIEW AND SOCIAL OUTCOME EVALUATION
OCTOBER 2005 – MARCH 2007**

National Museums Liverpool
Leicester City Arts and Museums Service
Salford Heritage Service
Tyne and Wear Museums

Report produced by Kate Rodenhurst, April 2007

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report seeks to explore the social impact of *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers*, a partnership initiative between four museum services. The report includes an evaluation of the *Freedom* programme, a series of artists commissions currently being delivered by the partnership, and a review of previous evaluations, reports by project workers, and other material. The draft Generic Social Outcomes (GSOs) devised by MLA have been used as the starting point for this research.

The desire to create a positive social impact is at the heart of the project, although its aims and objectives have almost always been described in terms of learning outcomes. It is implicit in the methodology of *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* that the project is intended to improve the well-being of the most vulnerable members of society, support community organisations through effective partnership working, and promote cohesion and tolerance in local communities.

This report demonstrates that *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers*:

- is providing opportunities for individuals to meet and socialise within their own community groupings, and with people of other diverse backgrounds
- provides opportunities for refugees and asylum seekers to share their own cultural heritage and learn more about British culture and history
- makes a contribution to improving participants' general sense of well-being, reducing their sense of isolation, and boosting their self-esteem
- supports children and young people to do something positive and enjoyable
- is providing significant benefits to partner community and voluntary organisations
- provides secure environments in which people can learn, play and relax.

The report also provides an overview of all activity in the project since the Baring Foundation grant of October 2005 came into effect.

This shows that the achievements of the project in terms of reaching refugees and asylum seekers, and creating new learning resources are impressive. Since October 2005 the total visitor number for the project is 13, 371. Between them the partners have installed eleven community exhibitions or displays in their venues, made six multicultural handling boxes, published five new learning resources, and made four films. In addition, the project has made a considerable contribution to the improvement of their service to refugees and asylum seekers, and non-English speaking visitors more generally, through the roll out of staff training programmes. A series of events and activities has successfully disseminating learning from this project across the wider museums sector.

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
PART ONE: PROJECT DESCRIPTION	
Project history	4
Project funding	5
Previous research and evaluation	6
Brief and scope of this report	6
PART TWO: PROJECT ACTIVITY AND OUTPUTS OCTOBER 2005 – MARCH 2007	
Five key themes (insert: key themes table)	8
Additional aims and objectives	9
Visitor numbers	10
Other outputs	10
PART THREE: QUALITATIVE EVALUATION AGAINST GENERIC SOCIAL OUTCOMES	
MLA and Generic Social Outcomes	11
Evaluation methodology	12
<i>Freedom</i> : An overview	12
<i>Freedom</i> in Leicester	13
<i>Freedom</i> in Liverpool	13
<i>Freedom</i> in Salford	14
<i>Freedom</i> in Tyne and Wear	14
The social impact of <i>Freedom</i>	15
GSO 1: Safer and Stronger Communities	15
GSO 2: Health and Well-being	17
GSO 3: Strengthening Public Life	18
Other evidence for Generic Social Outcomes	21
PART FOUR: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT	24
APPENDICES	
Bibliography	
Acknowledgements	

PART ONE: PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Project history

Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers emerged in 2003 in response to DCMS/DfES's Strategic Commissioning fund – a grant available for museums and galleries to develop their learning programmes through partnerships between national and regional museums.

The four project partners are National Museums Liverpool, Leicester City Arts and Museums Service, Salford Museum and Art Gallery and Tyne and Wear Museums. Each had only limited previous experience of working with asylum seekers and refugees. However all of the organisations did have a grounding in outreach work with local culturally diverse communities more generally.

The partner venues appointed project workers to develop links and network with local refugees and asylum seekers and their support agencies, in order to develop provision at the museum or on an outreach basis with the aim of:

- researching the needs of refugees and asylum seekers and developing appropriate activities
- developing learning resources appropriate to refugees and asylum seekers
- sharing best practice with other museums and galleries.

Since the original funding bid, the following five key themes have emerged to shape the development of new activities in each partner venue:

- schools and learning partnerships
- developing volunteering
- staff development
- family learning
- evaluation and dissemination of best practice.

The project has developed a distinctive style of working, using the partnership between museums as a means of sharing ideas, supporting project workers, and developing a professional understanding of best practice, whilst creating very different activities on the ground in each city, in response to local partnership opportunities, and the needs and wishes of local refugees and asylum seekers. Partners are not therefore developing all of the five key themes at the same rate, but are instead developing their own areas of specialist interest and sharing their experiences with the partnership. For example,

- National Museums Liverpool have led on the development of ESOL resources and activities to support local ESOL providers
- Salford Museum and Art Gallery have pioneered volunteering in museums by refugees and asylum seekers
- Leicester have used the refugees and asylum seekers project to reach thousands of school children with anti bullying messages

- Tyne and Wear Museums have created innovative arts projects and offered local refugees and asylum seekers the opportunity to exhibit the results.

Some elements of the project have been delivered jointly by the partners, mostly relating to dissemination of best practice, including:

- publication of a best practice guide for museums and galleries
- delivery of a series of regional conferences to disseminate the findings of the project
- commissioning of pieces by refugee artists which will tour partner venues (ongoing)

At present, the project is funded to continue until March 2008.

Project funding

The *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* initiative has been in operation in the four partner museum services since summer 2003, following a successful bid to the DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning fund. Strategic Commissioning was established to improve the quality, scale and scope of museum learning activity via partnerships between national and regional museum services. National Museums Liverpool have acted as the lead partner since the beginning, in relation to the overall financial and administrative management of the project and communication with funders.

The project has been supported by subsequent further phases of Strategic Commissioning funding, and has also been supported by a grant from the Baring Foundation's funding stream for arts organisations working with refugees, asylum seekers and migrants.

The project currently has funding secured from Baring Foundation until October 2007, and from DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning until March 2008, which will enable the continuation of contracts for project workers and activity development for participants until that date.

Year	DCMS Funding	Other Funding	Total Funding
2003/4	£90,000		£90,000
2004/5	£80,000	£3,000 from Northern Film and Media	£83,000
2005/6	£160,000	£7,500 Baring Foundation	£167,500
2006/7	£160,000	£115,000 Baring Foundation	£275,000
2007/8	£160,000	£57,500 Baring Foundation	£217,500
			£833,000

NB. The project has also been supported in-kind by sharing staffing support and revenue costs with partner organisations, and in 2004/5 by the provision

of staff salaries by Salford Museum and Art Gallery and National Museums Liverpool in order to bridge a gap in Strategic Commissioning funding. Provision of in-kind management and administrative support for the project from each partner organisation has been extensive.

Previous research and evaluation

In the process of researching this report, the consultant has drawn on previous evaluations and internal project reports. In addition to internal evaluation of individual activities in partner venues, *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* was:

- case studied in *Inspiration, Identity, Learning: The Value of Museums*, an evaluation of the first phase of Strategic Commissioning by the Research Centre for Museums and Galleries at the University of Leicester (2004)
- won a Learning North West Success Award from the Learning and Skills Council in 2004
- evaluated against MLA's Generic Learning Outcomes by Nicola Power, heritage consultant, in November 2005
- case studied in *A Sense of Belonging* (Creative Exchange) in 2005
- case studied in *Navigating Difference: cultural diversity and audience development* (Arts Council) in January 2006.

Evaluation has consistently indicated that this is a highly successful project. *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* has exceeded its visitor targets. The quality of learning provision within the project has been excellent, and participants have enjoyed a learning experience which has resulted in achievement across the five Generic Learning Outcomes (GLOs) as defined by MLA's Inspiring Learning for All. In addition, Nicola Power's research of 2005 suggested that there were additional social outcomes including growth in confidence and self-esteem, community integration and increased sense of well-being, which were worthy of further study.

The project has impacted on the partner organisations, supporting workforce development in the areas of ESOL and refugee and asylum seeker awareness. As a result of the project, the partners have strengthened their networks with a range of community organisations who are keen to continue the relationship.

Brief and scope of this report

Kate Rodenhurst, an independent consultant, was commissioned by the *Engaging Refugee and Asylum Seekers* project partners group in December 2006 to produce a report including the following:

- updated project outputs including numbers of participants involved since the project began in 2003
- an overview of all project activity since the Baring Foundation began funding the project in October 2005, and a review of progress against the themes and actions specified in the bid to Baring Foundation

- an evaluation of the project's impact on participants and the wider community, measured against Generic Social Outcomes (GSOs) as defined by MLA, focused on the delivery of artist commission projects in each partner city.

The report therefore does not aim to be a comprehensive review of the project, but to update the qualitative overview provided by Nicola Power in her research of November 2005, and to explore the evidence for delivery of social outcomes through the project.

Alongside the development of this report, film-maker Sam Meech recorded the experiences of project participants in each partner city, focusing on those taking part in *Freedom* - a project which has commissioned artwork for a forthcoming travelling exhibition and involved local refugees and asylum seekers in working with the artists.

PART TWO: PROJECT ACTIVITY AND OUTPUTS, OCTOBER 2005 – MARCH 2007

Five key themes

The project is currently funded by both DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning, and the Baring Foundation. Applications for funding from both of these sources were consistent in stating that the partnership wishes to develop further work against the following key themes:

- schools and learning partnerships
- developing volunteering
- staff development
- family learning
- evaluation and dissemination of best practice.

The table overleaf shows all of the activities carried out in the project since October 2005, both jointly and individually. The activities are categorised against the five key themes and colour coded to identify workshops and activities, exhibition programming, learning resources, and staff and volunteer development.

As the table demonstrates, across the partnership there has been significant progress against each of the five themes. Highlights of the project's activity since December 2005 include:

- Development of a schools programme for Refugee Week in Leicester, which uses the universal subject of bullying as a starting point for discussion and the challenging of common myths about refugees and asylum seekers
- Young ESOL learners in Liverpool making their own documentary, *The Human Animal*
- Creation of a pioneering volunteer programme at Salford Museum and Art Gallery, which is using best practice in the management and support of volunteers and developing new multicultural learning resources
- Delivery of staff training across the partnership to front of house and learning teams, covering awareness of the issues faced by refugees and asylum seekers, and how to support visitors with limited spoken English skills
- Delivery of an innovative and diverse programme of informal learning activities for refugees and asylum seekers of all ages, in family and community groups. Tyne and Wear's programme has included workshops on Shakespeare, wood carving, batik, and Sblock printing, providing freelance employment opportunities to several culturally diverse artists and performers
- Collaboration on delivering a nationwide series of best practice seminars for other professionals in the museums sector
- Joint commissioning of four original works by refugee artists to be exhibited in rotation at partner venues.

Additional aims and objectives

In addition to a commitment to developing new work under the five key themes, the Baring Foundation application states that the partnership will seek to take forward a range of further developments. These developments are listed below along with an indication of how the partnership has progressed these new areas of work.

- Maximising use of resources created in earlier stages of the project

There has been significant progress in this area. Tyne and Wear Museums have created a full teachers' resource pack to accompany the *Clued Up* DVD made in the project's first phase. All of the partners have created new ESOL resources based on the template provided by the ESOL pack for the Merseyside Maritime Museum. The best practice guide has been updated and reprinted.

- A pilot scheme to identify the potential of museums to work with young single men (post school age)

There is limited evidence of any of the partners developing activity specifically with the aim of reaching single men at the present time. However this has been identified as a priority for 2007/8.

- Raising awareness of the issues facing refugees and asylum seekers in schools

Leicester's schools programme aimed at promoting anti-bullying messages and better understanding of refugees and asylum seekers reached 2481 pupils between April 2006 and March 2007. Tyne and Wear Museums delivered a programme of arts activities in four Sunderland primary schools aimed at integration between traditional rural coalfield areas and diverse inner city schools. Salford have worked in partnership with Sola Arts to create a learning programme for schools which ties in to the Citizenship curriculum.

- Involvement of refugee, asylum seeker and migrant communities into consultation on new museum developments

National Museums Liverpool have included refugees and asylum seekers in the ongoing consultation process for the development of the new Museum of Liverpool. A representative of Liverpool LEA's Ethnic Minority and Traveller Achievement Service sits on the community consultation panel for the museum.

- Extending the availability of bilingual resources on gallery

There are no examples of any of the partners delivering bilingual on gallery resources at the present time.

- Developing the project's programming and contribution to initiatives such as Refugee Week and Black History Month.

Each of the project partners marked Refugee Week 2006 in their venues. Salford ran a day of events, A Small World in Salford, which featured performances from musicians from Bosnia, Russia, Ukraine, and Rwanda, as well as a range of art workshops for adults and children. Liverpool staged the first screening of *The Human Animal*, a documentary made by young ESOL learners with film maker Sam Meech. Leicester ran an extensive programme of workshops in primary and secondary schools.

To date there has been no specific Black History Month programming in partner venues, aimed at a refugee and asylum seeker audience.

Visitor Numbers

The total visitor number for the project since it started in August 2003 is **25,147**.

The total visitor number since the Baring Foundation began funding the project in October 2005 is an estimated **13,371**.

The figure includes a wide range of project beneficiaries:

- Refugees and asylum seekers
- School pupils
- Teachers and ESOL tutors
- Community workers
- Museum and gallery staff attending training and dissemination events.

Other outputs

Since October 2005, the project has created:

- 11 community exhibitions/displays
- 6 handling boxes
- 5 learning resources
- 6 staff training programmes
- 4 newly commissioned artworks
- 4 film projects
- and been represented at 6 conferences and seminars.

PART THREE: QUALITATIVE EVALUATION AGAINST GENERIC SOCIAL OUTCOMES

MLA and Generic Social Outcomes (GSOs)

MLA published *New Directions in Social Policy* in 2004. The report provided an overview of social policy areas in which museums, libraries and archives were making a difference, or had the potential to make a contribution. It stated that museums, libraries and archives contributed to the creation of social capital, 'the glue that binds and empowers communities', and therefore had a positive impact on communities and made a contribution to the Government's social agenda.

Following the publication of *New Directions in Social Policy*, MLA has developed and piloted Generic Social Outcomes (GSOs), in order to provide a common language for describing and evaluating the social impact of museums, libraries and archives. These defined GSOs additional to the existing Generic Learning Outcomes (GLOs) and the two systems are designed to be complementary. The GSOs were defined in relation to key Government policy agendas and mapped against them, for example *Every Child Matters*. They are defined in three broad thematic areas with sub categories, as follows:

1. Stronger and Safer Communities

- a. improving group and inter-group dialogue and understanding
- b. supporting cultural diversity and identity
- c. encouraging familial ties and relationships
- d. tackling the fear of crime and anti-social behaviour
- e. contributing to crime prevention and reduction

2. Health and Well-being

- a. encouraging healthy lifestyles, contributing to mental and physical well-being
- b. supporting care and recovery
- c. supporting older people to live independent lives
- d. helping children and young people to enjoy life and make a positive contribution

3. Strengthening Public Life

- a. encouraging and supporting awareness and participation in local decision-making and wider civic and political engagement
- b. building the capacity of community and voluntary groups
- c. providing safe, inclusive and trusted public spaces
- d. enabling community empowerment through the awareness of rights, benefits and external services
- e. improving the responsiveness of services to the needs of the local community, including other stakeholders.

At present the GSOs are still in draft form and have not been formally adopted or published by MLA.

Evaluation methodology

This evaluation set out to explore whether *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* delivers social outcomes as defined by MLA. This was done in two ways:

1. through an evaluation of the *Freedom* programme, including a series of very informal interviews with participants – artists, refugees and asylum seekers and community workers, and through observation of workshops by the researcher
2. through a review of previous evaluations and project reports, in which quotes and information have been mapped against the GSOs.

The *Freedom* programme was chosen as the subject for this evaluation because a version of it is being delivered by each partner. This is the first time that *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* has commissioned artists in a systematic way. This allowed comparisons to be made between different approaches to the delivery of the project, and conclusions drawn about how this affected the outcomes. However there was a drawback in that there were small numbers of community participants in each city, and this report should therefore be viewed as a snapshot and not as a comprehensive study.

During the evaluation, interviews were carried out with: all four commissioned artists, eight refugees and asylum seekers who were participants in the project, and four community workers. The researcher observed four workshops for refugees and asylum seekers. The project in Tyne and Wear has been the most difficult to study, because of delays to the start date, and as a result only the commissioned artist has been interviewed.

Freedom: An Overview

Freedom came about in response to recommendations from the comprehensive 2005 evaluation of *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* by Nicola Power.

Explore a national touring exhibition to demonstrate the national partnership, the range of work and engagement and impact at all four museums.

Monitor and evaluate future developments in relation to the framework of Generic Social Outcomes currently being developed by MLA to assess the impact of the project beyond the four museums.

The partnership decided that each partner would commission a refugee artist to create a piece of work for the museum. The creation and development of these works would in some way link with local refugees and asylum seekers. Following exhibition of the works at their 'home' museums in Refugee Week in June 2007, the works will rotate around the partner venues until each museum has exhibited each of the artworks. This solution was considered preferable to a joint touring exhibition of all of the work together because of complications arising from timetabling and availability of suitable exhibition space.

The theme of freedom was decided at a joint meeting of artists and project workers in December 2005. Apart from the shared theme, almost everything about the way the commissions have been developed has differed widely between the partners, with each shaping the project to meet their own local needs and exploit local opportunities for partnership working.

There is no written agreement between the partners on the aims of the project. However from discussion with the partners and observation of the initial project team meeting, the aims can be summarised as:

- for the partners to plan and deliver a joint project to showcase *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers*
- for *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* to have a visible presence on-gallery in partner venues
- to provide employment and exhibition opportunities to refugee artists
- to provide an opportunity for refugees and asylum seekers to work alongside a successful refugee artist.

An outline of the methodology and progress of each project is provided below.

Freedom in Leicester

Leicester City Museums Service commissioned Satta Hashem, a painter, to create a work for the project. Satta is originally from Iraq and his work draws extensively on Iraqi culture. He is well established as a professional artist, his work having been previously exhibited in several galleries and at the British Museum.

This commission has tied with *Island of Treasures*, an exhibition of paintings by Satta and another artist, John Lancaster. Satta's works in this exhibition at the Shree Jalaram Community Centre are based on the works of the Iraqi poet Abdulkareem Kased. The commissioned painting has been exhibited there as a work in progress.

Alongside the development of Satta's commissioned painting, he has been mentoring three artists from refugee, asylum seeker or migrant backgrounds, meeting them weekly in order to support and encourage their own artistic development, acting as a 'critical friend', and linking them to networks of other artists in Leicester. The two artists interviewed for this research clearly felt that this process was of significant personal benefit to them.

Freedom in Liverpool

National Museums Liverpool appointed sculptor Hilary Manuhwa via a competitive tendering process. Hilary is from Zimbabwe and though his work is contemporary it references traditional Shona sculpture.

Hilary worked closely throughout February half-term week with a group of young ESOL learners from Liverpool Community College. Although numbers

fluctuated from day to day, there were a core of nine people who took part in the project over the week, including two ESOL tutors who had given up their free time to look after the young people. The group were based in the Community Base at World Museum Liverpool for the week, and made two stone sculptures with Hilary's close involvement.

The sense of achievement and pride in their work was highly evident with this group.

Freedom in Salford

Salford Museum and Art Gallery commissioned textile artist Maryam Patala, who has created an embroidered map of the world with the working title *Freedom – Who Sets the Borders?* Maryam is Iranian and originally became linked with the museum as a participant in their outreach sessions, graduating to leading her own workshops, and she is now employed by the museum on a freelance basis.

Alongside the creation of this work, Maryam led textile based workshops for groups of local refugees and asylum seekers, mostly women, of all ages, some with children. The participants made their own embroidered countries and could take their work home. The process of learning a new skill created a positive social environment in which people could relax and communicate despite language differences.

Freedom in Tyne and Wear

Tyne and Wear Museums have commissioned Tina Gharavi, a film-maker based in South Shields, to create a short film. Tina has made several documentaries themed around cultural identity, and this commission is a further opportunity for her to show her work in a professional exhibition context.

Tina has chosen to focus on the Formula 1 Car Wash in South Shields, where many migrant labourers work long hours washing cars by hand. The film will highlight the existence of a migrant population in South Shields, which has long-established diverse communities, and the piece aims to make museum visitors stop and think about the familiar places they pass every day, and the diversity of the people who live and work there. The film is intended to be a video installation as opposed to a documentary, and therefore has not involved interviews or extended contact with the car wash staff.

Tyne and Wear Museums have planned community involvement in this project to tie in with the exhibition of works from all of the cities. They will be delivering a series of textile, painting, stone carving and film making workshops to coincide with the display of *Freedom* commissions over the forthcoming year.

The social impact of *Freedom*

Headline findings

- *Freedom* has had a demonstrable social impact, both for artists and community participants.
- The social impact of the project has been on a small scale, affecting individuals rather than wider communities. However there is potential for the second phase of the project to impact on the wider community, when works are exhibited.
- The project has demonstrated impact across all three GSOs: safer and stronger communities; health and well-being and strengthening public life.
- The project did not however deliver against all of the sub-outcomes in the GSO framework – indeed it would be difficult for any project to do so.
- Differences in the methodologies for each individual *Freedom* project have affected the extent to which each social outcome has been successfully delivered by each partner. Projects were all stronger in some areas than others.
- Young men taking part in the Liverpool project clearly relished the hands-on nature of the project, which was technical, physical and demanding, leading them to have a strong sense of pride in the finished result.
- The development of a small, supportive network of refugee and asylum seeker artists in Leicester is having considerable benefits for the participants.
- Projects don't always need to be themed around issues related to asylum, freedom, journeys etc. in order to have a social impact. The theme wasn't important or significant to participants in Liverpool, but it was very significant to those in Leicester.
- The project was not planned or designed with the GSOs in mind, and it may have been possible to make a stronger social impact if this had been a clear objective of the programme.
- As with other *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* projects, *Freedom* also demonstrably delivered a range of learning outcomes.
- There is potential for significant social impact in the next phase of the project, when works are exhibited, specifically in relation to GSO 1 - safer and stronger communities.

Generic Social Outcome 1: Safer and Stronger Communities

Freedom can be demonstrated to have had an impact on two of the sub-outcomes: improving group and inter-group dialogue and understanding (1a), and supporting cultural diversity and identity (1b).

The projects in Salford, Liverpool and Leicester all involved people of mixed backgrounds, ages and nationalities working together. Having a project to work on together helped the groups to communicate and make friends. It provided the chance to meet people of other nationalities and to tap into existing networks of people with the same cultural background (1a).

We haven't known each other before this project – participant

Although some of the ladies could not speak English, most shared a love of sewing and were able to communicate their ideas by needle and thread – project worker

I met lots of people coming here. It's good to find other people from Georgia to talk to. I didn't know there were others here. – participant

A common theme of the interviews was the opportunity provided by workshops and visits to the museum for people both to learn English, to interact with English people and to find out more about their new surroundings (1a, 1b).

I like the museum, I like history. Before I didn't know about [Salford] but now I have seen the old house and we looked at the clothes ... next week we are going to Liverpool. – participant

I practise my English at the museum – participant

It's good for them to come to the museum because they can practice finding their way around and asking for help. – community worker

It was important to the participants in the Liverpool and Leicester projects that their work would be on display for others to see, and that this would show a positive image of refugees and asylum seekers to other museum visitors (1b).

I want my name on it so that everyone can see how hard we worked and we did it ourselves. – RAS participant

I'm going to bring my parents to see it. – RAS participant

We should have a party. – RAS participant

I would like very much to display my work in the museum. The museum should tell people what is happening. – RAS participant

The artists also felt strongly that there was a benefit to the public display of this work, not just in terms of their own career development, although that was a strong factor, but also that their work had the potential to make museum visitors think about freedom and the related political issues, and that this would lead to improved understanding between different groups (1a, 1b).

I want people to think about who has the power to decide where borders are set. It's good for refugees and asylum seekers to see this in the gallery, but it's good for white communities too. - artist

Now I'm making lots of work all on the theme freedom. Freedom is an obsession. - artist

CASE STUDY:

Creating Safer and Stronger Communities at Salford Museum and Art Gallery

Salford's project made a demonstrable impact on GSO 1: Creating Safer and Stronger Communities. A community worker from a church based project in Salford felt that the chance to meet new people and improve English skills provided by the museum's outreach offer was of significant benefit to refugees and asylum seekers. Museum activity had become a core part of her planning even though she had been initially sceptical about what the museum could offer this group.

Workshops were devised so that participants had plenty of time to talk during the session, and the session encouraged collaboration between the participants, who were a varied group in terms of nationality and age – helping each other with cutting out materials, threading needles, learning new embroidery stitches and sharing the English words for objects, as well as words from other languages.

As well as providing the opportunity for different cultural groups to meet, two interviewees stated that museum-led activities had helped them to connect with other asylum seekers from their own community.

Generic Social Outcome 2: Health and Wellbeing

Involvement in *Freedom* had a positive impact on two of the health and well-being sub-outcomes. The project can be shown to have a positive impact on mental well-being (2a), and has supported young people to enjoy life and make a positive contribution (2d).

A positive impact on mental well-being is difficult to measure, and interviewees tend not to describe their feelings in those terms. However, taken together the evidence does point towards a substantial impact on confidence and self-esteem. Participants made friends through taking part in the project, and cemented their relationships with community workers (2a). They were inspired by the skill and success of the refugee artists employed to lead the projects (2d). Workshops took place in an environment where everyone praised and supported the efforts of others (2a, 2d). Some demonstrated a real sense of excitement at meeting the challenge of pushing themselves creatively and learning a new skill (2a, 2d).

The activities give people something to focus on and a reason to get out of the house – community worker

I've never done anything like this before. It's really hard work but I want to see it finished. - participant

Since working with Satta I have started to experiment with my artwork and started to break the rules [of traditional miniature painting] – participant

Although there was no clear evidence found for the project supporting care and recovery (2b) it is possible that the project could have had such an impact on some individual participants, many of whom will be in the process of recovering from trauma of some kind. However it was not felt possible to make a reliable assessment of this within the framework of this study.

CASE STUDY:

National Museums Liverpool helps young people to enjoy life and make a positive contribution

In Liverpool, a small group of young ESOL learners worked intensively for one week to create two sculptures in stone. They worked with professional tools and were involved in all aspects of the creation of the final piece. For the week, the Community Base at World Museum Liverpool became the group's own workshop space.

Three young men, two from Yemen and one from Slovakia, attended every day. For two of these, the first day of the project was their first visit to the museum. One of the boys was late and missed the organised minibus every time, but was still committed enough to make his own way on public transport each day. Had the project not been running, participants would have '*stayed at home, played Playstation*' or visited the City Centre to '*hang around the shops*'. Those interviewed all said that they would '*definitely*' come back to the museum for future projects.

The project created a strong bond between the group members because it was physically and mentally challenging. The participants were very proud of the finished pieces and their new skills. They were keen to show them off to friends and family, pleased that they would be on display in the museum, and were concerned to ensure that their names should appear on the text panel. Liverpool Community College will be taking one of the sculptures after the exhibition at National Museums Liverpool so that it can be publicly displayed for a longer period.

Generic Social Outcome 3: Strengthening Public Life

There is evidence of the project meeting four of the sub-outcomes of this GSO. It has supported wider civic engagement (3a), built the capacity of community and voluntary groups (3b), and provided safe, inclusive and trusted public spaces (3c). In Leicester, by introducing mentored artists to the facilities at Leicester's print workshop, the project has enabled community empowerment through the awareness of rights, benefits and external services (3d).

Interviews with project participants, particularly those who were established or amateur artists, suggested that the project was helping to support them to become more active and involved in society. Four artists have received professional paid commissions via this project, a clear social outcome (3a). For one of the employed artists, the project was their first professional commission.

I taught myself how to sew and make things. In my country the arts are much more traditional and I couldn't work as an artist there but here I have opportunities. To start with I was leading the workshops as a volunteer but now the museum pays me for my work. Some of the other volunteers get paid now too. – artist

One of the community participants felt that the project would support her to develop her artistic practice and make the transition from workshop leader to professional artist (3a). Another felt that the mentoring he received through the project was helping him to become a better artist, skills he would be able to use in his community work raising the profile of the situation being faced by Iraqis whose asylum claims had failed and who were facing deportation (3a, 3b).

The project had led artists and participants to consider the political issues around the theme of freedom and had resulted in some lively group discussions. Whilst this does not in itself meet one of the social outcomes, it suggests the potential for progression towards further involvement in civic and political activity.

We have discussed freedom for a long time, what it means to be free – artist

The work gets complicated when you look at some countries. How do you show Kurdistan? Or Palestine? I hope when people look at the work they will think about these things. – artist

We don't even have free speech in this country, the museum should show people - participant

By contrast others did not take the same political approach to the subject matter and struggled to come up with ideas. These younger participants felt that to them freedom was 'the internet, having a car'. Another participant felt that the museum was a place to escape from the day-to-day reality of her difficult and uncertain situation (waiting for a decision on her family's asylum claim) and did not want to take part in activity themed around her status as an asylum seeker.

The project has supported community and voluntary groups in several ways (3b). It has provided a resource to community organisations struggling to find the time, space and financial resources to provide social activities to refugees and asylum seekers.

The museum is now always part of my planning. – community worker

I was cynical at first. But we started off with some sessions during our holiday scheme and it's grown and grown. – community worker

Volunteers from the refugee and asylum seeker community, and partner organisations, have also helped to build the capacity of the museum to deliver more activity, and the project has demonstrated genuine, mutually

beneficial partnership (3b). Tutors from Liverpool Community College attended Liverpool's project every day during their own holidays to support the participants. Leicester has been able to extend the scope of their project by working in partnership and displaying the commissioned piece as a work in progress at a local community centre.

In Russia I worked at a puppet theatre and now I do shows for the children at Salford Museum. – participant

Participants in the project clearly demonstrated a feeling that the museum was a safe place in which they could feel happy and relaxed (3c). Through observation, it was clear that the young people using the Community Base at World Museum Liverpool had made themselves at home in the room, for example by playing their own music. All but one of the participants who came on the first day of the project returned during the week. At the Cornerstone Chapel in Eccles, Salford, a display on the wall showed the group on a previous visit to Ordsall Hall, trying on costume and exploring the handling collections.

I go to the museum to relax and look at beautiful things, it's like therapy. I don't think they should show things that bring people down. – participant

CASE STUDY:

Leicester Museums Service Strengthening Public Life

In Leicester the established and successful painter Satta Hashem is mentoring three young artists, one of whom is an asylum seeker from Iraq. These young artists were recruited through a competitive process and have not previously had the opportunity to work with a mentor, and all are gaining considerable benefits from the experience.

The participants in this mentoring programme will be designing the programme and publicity material for the exhibition of Satta's commissioned artwork, and are keen to explore opportunities for the public exhibition of their own work.

As a result of the project, the artists have developed a small but supportive network, with the potential to expand and develop. Satta has been able to provide guidance which has changed and improved their artistic practice, and dramatically improved their confidence, encouraging them to experiment and merge traditional and contemporary styles. The project is also signposting these artists to other creative organisations in Leicester, in particular Leicester Print Workshop, a subsidised facility for professional and community artists.

Other evidence for Generic Social Outcomes

It is almost impossible to retrospectively evaluate a project, especially against outcomes which were not part of its original aims and objectives. The section below lists quotes from partners' reports on activity and from previous evaluation. These brief project descriptions and comments from outreach workers have been mapped against the GSOs in order to give a flavour of how the wider *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* project is contributing to the delivery of social outcomes. This section demonstrates how the delivery of social outcomes has been central to the way the project operates and interacts with local participants and partners.

Generic Social Outcome 1: Stronger and Safer Communities

a. improving group and intergroup dialogue and understanding

I learnt how to respect refugees

I learnt from our poems that being a victim and a refugee or asylum seeker is quite hard and tough

The aims were to bring together and integrate schools from the rural coalfield villages and the inner city schools through art and culture

Leicester delivered workshops to schools...addressing preconceptions of refugees and asylum seekers in the media

I didn't just see, I was part of museum, I was active, I saw myself in others' place

Arts and drama were used as media to explore issues with students around asylum, leaving home, and challenging negative perceptions around asylum seekers

It was apparent that for some of the group who had limited spoken English, their speaking skills improved from the regular social interaction with the English people in the group

A crèche and refreshments were also provided which gave the women a chance to relax and socially bond as a group

The teachers were very grateful to have workers who could explain the issues and dispel the tabloid myths for such a complex subject

The class supports the students' understanding of British culture, history and industry

Both projects are part of a strategy which will help primary school children understand about different cultures, which will enable them to accept and mix with children of other nationalities who join their school and community

b. supporting cultural diversity and identity

they are developing Eritrea handling boxes

volunteers have been creating their home country handling boxes

the museum offers a view of the past of this area. It helps to understand the culture of the area where people may be settling, for better integration and to reduce the feeling of isolation

promoting of cultural exchange and understanding is a core responsibility of the volunteer programme

Generic Social Outcome 2: Health and well-being

a. encouraging healthy lifestyles, contributing to mental and physical well-being

I gave a testimony of Salih from Sudan, explaining how his involvement with the museum has improved his English language and provided further social engagement

I learnt how to tell emotions from masks

Today I am happy because it's a nice day for me and my family

His confidence is growing through working at the museum

The artist encouraged them to explore the emotions of the leading characters in Shakespeare and relate those emotions to themselves

The participants expressed immense pride in their work

We enjoyed being here with others

This provided a creative activity where the group, which is often isolated, could share one another's company

I enjoyed the workshop very much, it was educational and therapeutic

The first time we saw our film at the launch I felt very important. Thought, is that what we did?

Generic Social Outcome 3: Strengthening Public Life

a. encouraging and supporting awareness and participation in local decision-making and wider civic and political engagement

Nicola has recently provided him with a reference as he is applying for work

She revived a Rwandan dance group who performed at 'A Small World in Salford'

He is currently on a catering course so he has had less time to volunteer

Jean Claude has now completed his Active Citizenship City and Guilds to recognise the work he has already achieved at the museum

Several volunteers have now left the museum for employment, other volunteering opportunities or training

The refugee volunteer is now working part time and is attending a college course

b. building the capacity of community and voluntary groups

We have been inspired in our work by visiting partners to see with our own eyes what they have done

Leicester have been working with five refugees on a volunteer capacity to help with various aspects of the project such as collecting and researching objects for the handling resources

Examples of projects volunteers have worked on include engaging with visitors, developing children's learning activities, translating museum literature, collating and analysing visitor surveys and developing handling boxes

PART FOUR: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT

The recommendations are divided into three distinct areas:

- those which relate to the next phase of the *Freedom* programme
- those which take lessons from the *Freedom* programme which should be considered in any future project development,
- and those which relate to the continuing development of the wider *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* initiative.

Freedom - phase two

1. The forthcoming exhibitions of project work should have a clearly defined set of learning and social outcomes, agreed by all of the project partners and set out in writing. At present, the purpose and intended outcomes of these exhibitions are not clear.
2. Associated interpretation and learning events should be designed with this defined set of learning and social outcomes in mind.
3. The forthcoming exhibitions should be evaluated in order to establish what the learning and social outcomes for artists, participants and museum visitors have been, with particular reference to GSOs 1a and 1b.
4. Artists and participants should be consulted and involved in the development of launch events for the *Freedom* exhibitions. Adequate budget should be set aside to enable launch events to be a real celebration of the participants' achievements.
5. While other projects under the *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* umbrella are not appropriate vehicles for publicity because of the participants' need for confidentiality, this project lends itself to media coverage and wider promotion, and is an opportunity to generate positive news stories about museums working with refugees.
5. The partners should give consideration to developing a *Freedom* website so that the commissioned artworks and Sam Meech's film can be brought together in one place.
6. The project partners should seek to develop a joint case study outlining the four distinct methodologies and their varying impacts which can be disseminated to other museums and galleries.

Freedom – lessons for the future

1. The project would have benefited from a clear statement of aims and objectives drawn up at the beginning and setting out how the project would be delivered, and this should be considered in any future joint working.

2. The opportunity to work on extended and complex creative projects has considerable impact on participants' confidence and self-esteem. The Liverpool project provides a potential model for the engagement of young men in ERAS.

3. Opportunities for further artist mentoring networks should be considered across the partnership. Leicester City Museums Service should explore the potential for continued engagement with the three artists mentored through the project.

Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers – continuing development

1. The partnership could work jointly to share ideas and consider solutions around contingency planning for staff turnover. All of the individual partners have experienced delays and a loss of impetus to their projects because of staff leaving and the time it takes to recruit and induct new project workers. This has had a particularly heavy impact in Liverpool and Salford over the past year.

2. Partners need to start planning for the longer-term sustainability of their work with refugees and asylum seekers after March 2008 as a matter of urgency, given the likelihood that current sources of funding will not be made available again after that date. Funding applications should be planned in consultation with community partners in order to protect the positive working relationships which have been built between them.

3. Partners should seek to improve their consultation processes with potential participants before the start of new projects, in order to agree themes and ideas which will inspire the group.

4. The project should carry out some consultation with local service providers in order to identify the best ways to pilot work with single male asylum seekers in order to meet its commitment to developing provision for this audience group (Baring Foundation grant application, 2005).

5. The partnership should consider whether to make delivering one of the social outcomes a key theme for the forthcoming year. At present, four of the five key themes relate to learning rather than social outcomes, volunteering being the only current theme which has a clear synergy with the GSOs.

APPENDIX ONE

Bibliography

Research Centre for Museums and Galleries, University of Leicester, *Inspiration, Identity, Learning: the value of museums* (RCMG/DCMS, June 2004)

Power, Nicola, *An Evaluation of Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers 2003 – 2005* (November 2005)

Morris, Jane, with Orchard, Kate and Davison, Fiona, *Refugee Heritage Project: Report on the London Museums Hub project to record refugee heritage 2004-06* (Renaissance London, 2007)

Creative Exchange, *A Sense of Belonging* (2005)
<http://cultureartsrefugees.creativexchange.org/car>

Joseph Rowntree Trust, *Moving On from Destitution to Contribution: Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust Inquiry into Destitution Amongst Refused Asylum Seekers* (April 2007)

Maitland, Heather (ed), *Navigating Difference, Cultural Diversity and Audience Development* (Arts Council, 2005)

Acknowledgements

Thank you to the following people who contributed to the research process:

Several individual refugees and asylum seekers including Arif, Lena, Tamona, Anwar, Nargis, Liverpool Community College students and others.

Anna Bunney
Ann-Marie Cassidy
Claire Duffy
Tina Gharavi
Satta Hashem
Hilary Manuhwa
Caroline Mean
Maryam Patala
Shriti Patel
Tony Spencer
Sophie Robinson

ESOL tutors and students at Liverpool Community College
Staff and volunteers at Cornerhouse Chapel, Eccles
Staff and volunteers at Leicester Print Workshop
Staff and volunteers at Shree Jalaram Community Centre, Leicester